1295

1954-59 **File No.** 2017/36-II(A)

A CLASS P.W **DEPARTMENT**

E-BRANCH

Subject:— Establishment
Electrical Circle
Sanction to additional

A[K]-1954

✓

E-B.

File No. 2017/36-II(A)

Eld. Sectt. Slip. 94 A

G.R., G.D., No. 2408, dated 22-6-22.]

Correspondence

DOCKET SHEET

Subject :—

File No. 2017/36-II(A)

P.W DEPT.

E BRANCH.

References :—

The original file is sent to Maharashtra.

Date.	To whom sent.	Notes and instructions.

Confidential.
No. 2017/36 - E

Public Works Department,
Bombay Castle (Bombay No. 1),
9th June, 1951.

To

The Secretary,
Bombay Public Service Commission.

Subject:- Appointment of an Executive Engineer, Electrical Division and Electrical Inspector.

I am directed to refer to your letter No. 830, dated the 11th May 1951, and to state that the reduction of the period of experience from ten to six years for the post of Executive Engineer, Electrical Division and Electrical Inspector, was intentional.

The Electrical Engineer to Government has, however, since intimated that the matter has been carefully considered by the Advisory Technical Committee appointed by the Government of India for the revision of the Indian Electricity Rules, 1937, and in the revised rules, it has been proposed that no person should be appointed as an Electric Inspector unless:-

(a) he possesses a degree or diploma in electrical Engineering from a recognised University or College, and

(b) he has been regularly engaged for a period of at least eight years in the practice of electrical engineering of which not less than two years have been spent in an electrical or mechanical engineering workshop or in generation, transmission or distribution of electricity.

2. I am accordingly to request that the period of requisite experience for the post may kindly be raised from six to eight years.

3. The question of amending rule 104-A of Appendix 'C' of the Bombay Civil Services Classification and Recruitment Rules suitably is under the consideration of Government and orders thereon will issue in due course.

(K. V. Joglekar)
Deputy Secy. to the Govt. of B'bay,
Public Works Department.

Copy.....

Copy with a copy of the letter under reference, forwarded to:-

the Electrical Engineer to Government,
Shri S. G. Nadkarni, B. A., B. Sc. (Bom.),
M. S. C. (Eng.) (Lond.), A. C. G. I., D. I. C.,
A. M. I. M. E., M. I. E. E., M. I. E., Electrical
Engineer to Government,

for information.

No. 830/144.

Bombay Public Service Commission,
Bank of India Building, Mahatma Gandhi Road,
Bombay No. 1, 7th July 1951.

From,
The Secretary,
Bombay Public Service Commission.

To
The Secretary to the Government of Bombay,
Public Works Department, Bombay.

Sir,

With reference to Government Letter No. 2017/36-E, dated the 9th June 1951 regarding recruitment for the post of Executive Engineer Electrical Division and Electrical Inspector, I am directed to state that in advertising the post the Commission have adopted the provisions of revised rule reproduced in the letter.

2. It is presumed that orders for the amendement of rule 104A referred to in paragraph three of the letter will be issued in consultation with the Commission. The presumption may be confirmed.

Yours faithfully,
Sd/- B. J. Israel,

Secretary,
Bombay Public Service Commission.

No. 2017/36-E.

Public Works Department,
Bombay Castle (Bombay No. 1).
18th July 1951.

To

The Secretary,
Bombay Public Service Commission.

Subject:- Amendment to Rule 104-A of Appendix 'C' to the Bombay Civil Services Classification and Recruitment Rules.

I am directed to invite attention to paragraph 2 of your letter No. 830/144, dated the 7th July 1951, and to state that the presumption made therein is confirmed.

(K. V. Jogleker),
Deputy Secretary to the Govt. of Bombay,
Public Works Department.

D. A. Nil.

E. Br.

2017/36/59305.

P. W. D.

Submitted with ref. to para. 2 of the O. N. dt. the 17.7.1951.

2. Pl. See para. 3 of C. L. No. 2017/36-E dated the 9-6-51.

The following rule may be substituted for rule 104-A of Appendix 'C' of the B. C. S. C. & R. Rules.

"104-A. The post shall be filled either by the nomination of a direct recruit or by the promotion of an Officer holding a lower post in the Electrical Circle. A direct recruit must not more than 35 years of age at the date of apptt. and must possess a degree or diploma in Electrical Engrg. from a recognised University or College. He must satisfy the requirements of rule 4 of the Indian Ely. Rules 1937, i. e. he must have been regularly engaged for a period of at least eight years in the practice of electrical engrg. of which not less than two years should have been spent in an electrical or mechanical engrg. work shop or in the generation, transmission or distribution of ely."

3. The Ex. Engr. to Govt. may see his papers U. O. in the first instance before ...

before the B. P. S. C. is consulted in the matter.

Id/-
28-8-51.

U. O. R. to the Elecl. Engr. to Govt. dated 30-8-51.

Below U. O. R. No. 2017/36/59305 dated the 30th August 1951

from Government in the Public Works Department.

No. G. 37/7488 of 1951.
Bombay 4th October 1951.

Returned with compliments.

2 The proposed amended rule seems to be in order.

Id/-
Electrical Engineer to Govt.

5

E. Br. 2017/36/85677

P. W. D.

Submitted with ref. to the O. N. dated the 28-8-51.

2. Pl. see the Elecl. Engr. to Govt's. U. O. R. at p. 77 ante

The draft put up may issue, if approved, after the P. & S. D. has seen U. O.

Issued.
18.10.51.

D. S.
U. O.

U. O. R. to the P. & S. D. dated 20-10-51.

Seen & returned to the P. W. D.

2. The draft recruitment rule needs recasting as follows:-

"104-A. Appointment shall be made either by promotion of an officer in the Electrical Engineering Circle or by nomination or by submission for among candidates who:-

(a) are not more than 35 years of age,

(b) Possess a degree on diploma in Electrical Engineering of a recognised University or College.

(c) Satisfy the requirements of rule of the Indian Ely. Rules 1937 i. e. they have been regularly engaged for a period of at least eight years.

in the practice of Electrical Engineering of which not less than two years. Shld. have been spent in an Electrical and or Mechanical Engineering workshop are in the generation, transmission or distribution of Electricity.

Issued.
25-10-51.

Returned to P. W. D. dt. 26-10-51.

E. Br. P. W. D.

The draft amendement to Rule 104-A of App. 'C' of the B. G. S. O. & R. Rules proposed by the P. & S. D. may be accepted. Though there is no material change in the amendment drafted by the P. & S. D. and that of this Deptt., yet the Ea.

El. Engr. to Govt. may see these papers u. o. before issue of the draft at p. 13 post.

Issued.
30-10-51.

Id/-
2-11-51.

U. O. R. to the Elect. Engr. to Govt. dated 5-11-51.

Below U. O. R. No. 2017/36/92605 dated the 5th November 1951 from Government in the Public Works Department.

No. G. 37/8715 of 1951.
Bombay, 1. 8th November 1951.

Returned with compliments.

2. The draft amendment to Rule 104-A as proposed by the Political & Services Department in para 2 of its note dated 25-10-1951 is simply a recast of the original draft of the Public Works Department and it seems to be in order.

Id/-
Electrical Engineer to Govt.

Draft amendment to Rule 104-A of Appendix 'C' of the Bombay Civil Services Classification and Recruitment Rules.

104-A Appointment shall be made either by promotion of an officer in the Electrical Circle or by Nomination from among candidates who:-

(a) are not more than 35 years of age.
(b) Posses a degree in Electrical or in El& Mechl. Engineering of a recognized University
(c) satisfy the requirements of rule 4 of the Indian Ely. Rules 1937 i. e. they have been regularly engaged for a period of at least 8 years, in the practice of Electrical Engineering of which not less than two years. should have been spent in an Electrical or Mechanical Engineering workshop or in the generation, transmission or distribution of Electricity."

Issued.
12-11-51. 2017/36 P.-W. D.
E. Br. 96071

The draft at p. 11 within may now issue with the draft amendement overleaf.

Issued. 12-11-51. Id/- 12-11-51. D. S.

No. 2017/36-E.

Public Works Department.
Bombay Castle, (Bombay No. 1).
14th November 1951.

To

The Secretary,
Bombay Public Service Commission.

Subject:- Amendment to Rule 104-A of Appendix 'C' to the Bombay Civil Services Classification and Recruitment Rules.

I am directed to invite attention to Government letter No. 2017/36-E, dated the 18th July 1951, and to forward, for the advice of the Commission, the accompanying draft amendment to Rule 104-A of Appendix 'C' of the Bombay Civil Services Classification and Recruitment Rules.

Id/-
Deputy Secy. to the Govt. of B'bay.
Public Works Department.

D. A.- drafr rule.

CONFIDENTIAL.

No. 73(a) (vi)-B.
Bombay Public Service Commission, Bank of India Building, Mahatma Gandhi Road,
Bombay No. 1, 31st Dec.51.

From

The Secretary,
Bombay Public Service Commission.

To

The Secretary to the Government of Bombay,
Public Works Department.

Sir,

With reference to Government letter No. 2017/36-E, dated the 14th November 1951, regarding the amendment of rule 104-A in Appendix 'C' to the Bombay Civil Services Classification and Recruitment Rules relating to the post of Executive Engineer, Electrical Division, and Electrical Inspector, Bombay State, I am directed to state that the basic qualification mentioned in clause (b) of the proposed revised draft, viz. a degree or diploma in Electrical Engineering of recognised University or College is substantially lower than that prescribed in the present rule or even that prescribed in rule 104-B for the lower posts of Deputy Engineer, in so far as it makes eligible holders of diplomas which are not generally recognised as....

as equivalent to University degrees. A University degree or its equivalent has been prescribed for equivalent posts in other branches of the Engineering Services, and diploma holders are eligible for direct recruitment only to posts of non-gazetted rank like Overseers. Moreover, with the establishment of Engineering College preparing students for University degrees, graduates are now available in increasing number and there would seem to be little justification for putting diploma holders on the same level for direct recruitment as persons holding University degrees or equivalent ~~equivexx~~ qualifications. The Commission may be informed why special consideration is proposed to be shown to mere diploma holders and why the qualification should not be stated as a degree of a recognised University in Electrical or Electrical and Mechanical Engineering or a qualification recognised as equivalent to a University degree.

Yours faithfully,

Id/- 31/12/51

Secretary,
Deputy Public Service Commission.

9 ?

2017/36
856.

P.W.D.
E.

Ex Submitted with reference to G. L. N at p. ante .

2. The B. P. S. C. do not agree to diploma holders being made eligible for direct recruitment to the posts of Ex. Engrs., El. Dn. and El. Inspectors as proposed in clause (b) of the draft amendment to Rule 104-A of App. 'C' They state that the diploma holders are eligible for direct recruitment only to the posts of non-gazetted rank like Overseers. They further argue that with the Engineering Colleges preparing students for University degrees, graduates are now available in increasing numbers and would not therefore be just putting diploma holders on the same level as persons holding University degrees or equivalent qualifications. In this connection they desire to know why special consideration is proposed to be shown to mere diploma-holders and why the qualification should not be stated as a degree of a recognised University in El. or in El. & Mechanical Engineering or a qualification recognized as equivalent to a University degree. There is great force in the arguments advanced by the Commission. In the existing Rule the academical qualification prescribed for the posts is Corporate Membership of the Institution of El. Engrs., England, or a University degree in El. Engrs., England, or a University degree in El. Engineering. The clause was so worded at the instance of the El. Engr. who stated that the Advisory Technial Committee appointed by the Govt. of India for the revision of the Indian Electricity Rules, 1937, proposed that no person should be appointed as El. Inspector unless he possesses, among other qualifications, a degree or diploma in El. Engrg. from a recognised University or College. The main point on which the rule is considered to be amended is, however, on the length of practical experience the candidate should have in El. & Mechl. Engrg. and in similar workshops. Clause (b) of the draft rule may therefore be amended as follows:-

"(B) possess a degree in El. Engrg. of a recognized University or equivalent...

/0 70

equivalent qualifications."

3. The El. Engr. to Govt. may see these papers unofficially before replying to the P. S. C.

Issued Id/-
15-1-52.

Confdl.

U. O. R. to the Elecl. Engr. to Govt. dated 19-1-52.

Below U. O. R. No. 2017/36/856 dated the 19th January 1952, from Government in the Public Works Department.

No. C/11935 of 1952.
Bombay 21st January 1952.

CONFIDENTIAL.

Returned, with compliments.

2. The reason for permitting Diplomaholders in Electrical Engineering of a recognised University or College to compete for the post of Executive Engineer, Electrical Division and Electric Inspector, Bombay State, is the possibility of obtaining a Diploma holder with practical experience, who will be far more suitable for the post than an inadequately experienced Graduate in Electrical Engineering. This will be evident from the fact that, if a Diplomaholder who has been working with a licensed undertaking continuously, holds an important post and has long experience of not only generation, transmission and distribution of electricity, but also of construction of electrical works, he will be disqualified from applying for the post, in spite of the fact that he is very well suited for the post of an Executive Engineer and Electric Inspector under the Indian Electricity Rules; while a young and not particularly brilliant Graduate who has been for a couple of years [illegible] with an electrical undertaking in a very subordinate capacity, whether generation, transmission, or distribution of electricity, and subsequently has been for another six years with an electrical dealer as a salesman for electrical goods, will authmatically be qualified to apply for the post..

post, even though such graduate will be far less suited for the post than the Diploma holder referred to above. In such cases, the Public Service Commission has in the pat been rightly giving separate marks for educational qualifications, practical experience, and personality, and therefore the undeserving Diplomaholders would automatically be superseded by deserving Graduates, while at the same time, an undeserving Graduate will be prevented from getting unjustified preference over a deserving Diploma holder.

3. In view of the above remarks, I consider that Diploma holders in Electrical Engineering should be permitted to compete for the post along with the Graduates in Electrical Engineering.

Sd/-
Electrical Engineering to
Government.

2017/36
6783.

P. W. D.

E. Br. -

Submitted with reference to the O. N. d. the 14-1-52.

2. For the reasons stated in his U. O. R. overleaf, the El. Engr. to Govt. considers that the Diploma holders in Elecl. Engrg. should also be permitted to complete for the ~~posts~~ of Ex. Engrs. El. Dns. and Elecl. Inspectors along with the Graduates in El. Engrg. It is for consideration whether the views of the El. Engr. to Govt. may be accepted.

3. The P& S. D. may also see these papers U. O. before replying to the

B. P. & S. G.

Issued. 9/1
4-~~10~~-52.

It is only in exceptional cases that a Deplomaholder with considerable experience may be found suitable as E. E. for preferred ordinary jobs. As a rule a graduate should be perform with equal experience and shoulder A graduate is expected to be better qualified to shoulder responsibilities althouth there may be exception. But there only prove the general rule.

2017/36
6783.

We may agree with the B. P. S. C. to have the basic qualifications as a degree in Electrical or Electrical or mechanical Engineering.

Id/-
6-2-52.

I agree with the B.P.S.C.

The arguments advanced by the Elec. Engr. are not convincing Certain posts (25%) would be reserved for promotion of subordinates and this would provide the necessary openings to diplomaholders in service. Where a graduate with suitable experience is not available, it will be necessary to consider diploma holders. But in view of the increasing number of graduates Elecl. Engineering this cant stringency need not be provided for, by including diploma holders in the recruitment Rules Branch.

The practice in the elecl. eng. branch should now come in line with that in the civil branch and direct recruitment may be reserved for graduates.

Id/-
6-2-52.

Confidential.

U. O. R. to the P. & S. D. dated 11-2-52.

P. & S. D.-

Seen & returned to the P. W. D.

Id/- Id/-
15-2-52. 15-2-

U.O.R.
Returned to P. W. D. dt. 18-2-

E. Br. P. W. D.

Submitted with ref. to this Deptt. U. O. R. dated the 11-2-52.

2. The P. & S. D. having agreed to our proposal, the draft put up may issue.

Id/- 27-2-52. Id/- 28-2-52. Id/- 28-2-52.

Secretary will please discuss. I take it that the amendement as proposed would permit the appointment of an experienced or competent Diploma-holder to Ex- Engineers post. Is not a certain percentage of recruitment from for the Diploma holder to Ex. Engineers post permissible?

Issued.
3-3-52.

13

(From p. 28)

Discussed with H. M.

The reply to the Commrs. should make clear that 25% of the posts of Ex. Engrs. Elecl. Dns. will be filled by promotion of Dy. Engrs, that this percentage will be the same as for B. S. E. - Cl. I (for recruitment from Cl. II) and that this will provide the requisite opportunities to diploma holders.

Id/- [illegible]

2017/36
R6[illegible]. P. W. D.

Resubmitted with reference to the Secy's note, d. the E. Br.
4-3-52.

2. Attention is invited to G. L. No. 1968/48, [illegible] E(I), d. the 12-6-50, wherein the percentage proposed for promotion from Class II to Class I of B. S. E. is 33 1/3%. The percentage suggested by the Recruitment Committee in their report is, however, 25%, which is accepted by this Deptt. Revised draft in accordance with the Secy's note is therefore put up for approval.

Id/-
11-3-52. Id/- 11-3-52. Id- 13-3-52.

14

Confidential
No 2017/36-E

Public Works Department,
Bombay Castle (Bombay No. 1),
13th March, 1952.

To

The Secretary,
Bombay Public Service Commission.

Subject:- Amendment to Rule 104-A of Appendix 'C' to the Bombay Civil Services Classification and Recruitment Rules.

I am directed to refer to your letter No. 73(a) (vi)-B, dated the 31st December 1951, and to state that Government agrees with the observations made therein. Clause (b) of the draft amendment to Rule 104-A of Appendix 'C' of the Bombay Civil Services Classification and Recruitment Rules Accompanying Government Letter, Public Works Department, No. 2017/36-E, dated the 14th November 1951, should please be amended as under:-

"Possess a degree in Electrical or Electrical and Mechanical Engineering of a recognized University."

2. As regards appointment by promotion, it is proposed that twenty-five per cent. (or other percentage) of the posts of Executive Engineers in the Electrical Circle should be filled in by promotion of Deputy Engineers exactly as for promotions from Bombay Service of Engineers, Class (II), to Bombay Service of Engineers, Class (I). This will provide the requisite opportunities to the diploma holders amongst the Deputy Engineers in the Electrical Circle.

O/C Sd/- 14/3/52
Deputy Secretary to the Government
of Bombay, Public Works Department.

D. A. Nil.

Issued
14-3-52.

15

No. 73 (s) (vi)-B.
Bombay Public Service Commission,
Bank of India Building, Mahatma Gandhi
Road, Bombay No. 1, 27th March 1952.

From
The Secretary,
Bombay Public Service Commission.

To
The Secretary to the Government of Bombay,
Public Works Department, Bombay.

Sir,

With reference to the correspondence resting with Government letter No.: 2017/36-E, dated the 13th March 1952, I am directed to state that the Commission approve the revised rule 104-A in Appendix 'C' to the Bombay Civil Services Classification and Recruitment Rules relating to the post of Executive Engineer, Electrical Division and Electrical Inspector, Bombay, forwarded with Government letter No.: 2017/36-E, dated the 14th November 1951, as amended by paragraph 1 of Government letter No: 2017/36 -E, dated the 13th March 1952.

Yours faithfully,
Sd/- 27/3/52
SECRETARY
Bombay Public Service Commission.

16

E. Br. 2017/36
30064.
P. W. D.

Submitted with reference to G. L. No. 2017/36 £ d. the 13-3-52.,

2. The B. P. S. C. have approved of the draft amendment to Rule 104-A of Appendix 'C' of the Bombay Civil Services Classification and Recruitment Rules. The amendment may now be forwarded to the P. & S. D. for issuing the necy. correction slip. Requisite draft is ppt up for approval.

Id/-
12- 4-52.

Id/-
14-4-

D.\S!

Secy

17

LETTER.

No. 3017/36 E. Public Works Department,
Bombay Castle (Bombay No. 1),
16th April 1952.

To

The Chief Secretary to the Government of Bombay,
Political and Services Department.

Subject:- Amendment to Rule 104-A of Appendix 'C' of the Bombay Civil Services Classification and Recruitment Rules.

I am directed to forward herewith the draft amendment to Rule 104-A of Appendix 'C' of the Bombay Civil Services Classification and Recruitment Rules, which has been approved by the Bombay Public Service Commission, and to request that the necessary correction slip to the Rule may please be issued accordingly.

Sd/- 16/4/52
Deputy Secretary to Govt.

* Pl. see p-6 D. A. Amendment.*

Copy to the Secretary, Bombay Public Service Commission, with reference to his letter No. 73 (a) (vi)-E, dated the 27th March 1952.

Copy with a copy of the amendment, forwarded to the Electrical Engineer to Government for information.

Issued. with
16-4-52. copies

E. Br. 2017/36/30064

Resubmitted with ref. to this Deptt letter No. P. W. D. 2017/36-E, dated the 16-4-52.

2. These papers may be refd. U. O. to the P. & S. D. with a request please to supply copies of correction slip to Rule 104-A of Appl 'C' of the Bombay Civil Services Classification and Recruitment Rules, if issued by that Deptt.

Id/-
18-12-52. Id/-
18-12-52.
U. O. R. to P. & S. D. d. 18-12-52.

A. S.(I)

P. & S. D.

Seen and returned to the P. W. D.

2. The Correction slip is not yet been issued.

Issued.
22-12-52. Id/- 22-2-52.
U? O. R. to P. W. D. dt. 22-12.

A.Vs.

E. Branch.

P. W. D.

Await'

Id/-
24-12-52. AS(I)

Id/-.
24-12-52.

E. Br. 2017/36/30064

P. W. D.

Resubmitted with refce. to the notes within.

2. The papers may be refd. U. O. to the P. & S. D. with a request Pl. to supply copies of correction slip to Rule 104-A of App. 'C' of the B. C. S. C. & H. Rules, if issued by that Deptt.

Id/-
31.1.53.

Id/-
3-1-51.
U. O. R. to the P. & S. D. d. 2-2-53.

P. & S. D.

The correction slip has not yet been issued.

2. Correction slips to the Recruitment Rules are not issued single-handedly. Amendments sanctioned by the various Deptts. are collected and correction slips on the basis thereof are issued all at one time. This is necy for administrative convenience as well as for avoiding inconvenience that may be caused by issue of correction slips singly and in a brisk flow.

3. Action will be taken on the amendment in question though it may take some time. When the action is completed the P. W. D. will be informed about it. That Deptts. need not remind.

Id/- Id/- 4-2-53.
U. O. R. to P. W. D. d- 5-2-
E. Br. P. W. D.
Await. Id/- 6-2-53.

E. Br. 2017036/14646

P. W. D.

Submitted with this Deptt. U. O. R., dt. the 2-2-53.

2. The pps. may be refd. W. O. to the P. & S. D., with a request to supply copies of correction slip to Rule 104-A of App. 'C' of the Bombay Civil Services Classification and Recruitment Rules, if issued by that Deptt. by now.

Id/-
13-5-45.

Id/-
13-5-45.

U. O. R. to the P. & S. D. d. 15-5-45.

P & S.D.

As corrections slips on the amendemnt in question have been issued so far. General revision of the B. C. S. C.& R. Rules manual has been undertaken in this Deptt. all amendment to the rules sanctioned by the Sect. Deptt. after the manual was last reprinted will to incorperated in the manual during the course of the general revision the correction slips as such need therefore not be received and reference be issued. The P. W. D. may be informed accordingly.

Id/-
24-4.
U. O. R. to P. W. D. 28-4-45.

E. Br. 2017-36./ 55778

P. W. D.

Submitted with ref. to this Deptt. U. O. R. dt. 1544-45.

Pl. see the P. & S. D. note on P. which states that no correction slips on the Amendment in question have been issued so far as the general revision of the B. C. S. C. & R. Rules incorporting all the amendements in the new copy of the Manual is undertaken by the P. & S. D. This may therefore be kept in await.

Id/-
29-4-

A. S. (I)

Id/-
30-4-53.